

# Human Resources Committee (AGM) Agenda



**Date:** Thursday, 4 July 2019

**Time:** 10.00 am

**Venue:** City Hall, College Green, Bristol, BS1 5TR

## Distribution:

**Councillors:** Harriet Bradley, Richard Eddy, Gary Hopkins, Jeff Lovell, Paula O'Rourke, Ruth Pickersgill, Jon Wellington and Tim Kent

**Copies to:** John Walsh (Director: Workforce & Change, Mark Williams (Head of Human Resources), Mark Jefferson (Analytics Adviser), Steve Gregory (Democratic Services); Tim O'Gara - Director - Legal & Democratic Services; Husinara Jones - Senior Practitioner (Solicitor)

**Issued by:** Steve Gregory, Democratic Services  
City Hall, PO Box 3167, Bristol, BS3 9FS  
Tel: 0117 92 24357

E-mail: [democratic.services@bristol.gov.uk](mailto:democratic.services@bristol.gov.uk)

**Date:** Wednesday, 26 June 2019

# Agenda

**1. Election of Chair 2019/20**

**2. Election of Vice-Chair 2019/20**

**3. Welcome, Introductions and Safety Information**

**(Pages 5 - 6)**

**4. Apologies for Absence**

**5. Declarations of Interest**

**6. Membership of the Committee 2019/20**

Councillors: Harriet Bradley, Richard Eddy, Gary Hopkins, Jeff Lovell, Ruth Pickersgill, Paula O'Rourke, Jon Wellington

**7. Terms of Reference**

To note the Terms of Reference as approved at Full Council on 21 May, 2019

**(Pages 7 - 8)**

**8. Dates and Times of meetings 2019/20**

Meetings to commence at 10 am on the following dates -

26 September 2019;



7 November 2019;  
16 January 2020;  
5 March 2020;  
30 April 2020;

## 9. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

To agree the minutes of the last meeting as a correct record.

**(Pages 9 - 13)**

## 10. Public Forum

*NB. up to 30 minutes is allowed for this item*

Any member of the public or councillor may participate in Public Forum. The detailed arrangements for so doing are set out in the **Public Information Sheet** at the back of this agenda. Please note that the following deadlines will apply in relation to this meeting:-

**Questions** - Written questions must be received 3 clear working days prior to the meeting. For this meeting, this means that your question(s) must be received in this office at the latest by 5 pm on 28 June, 2019.

**Petitions and Statements** - Petitions and statements must be received on the working day prior to the meeting. For this meeting this means that your submission must be received in this office at the latest by 12.00 noon on 3 July, 2019.

## 11. Work Programme - 2019/20

To note the work programme.

**(Page 14)**

## 12. Exclusion of the Press and Public

That under s.100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following item(s) of business on the grounds that it (they) involve(s) the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph(s) 1 (respectively) of Part 1 of schedule 12A of the Act.

## 13. Salary of Executive Director - People

**(Pages 15 - 25)**



**14. Salary of Director Education & Skills and Executive Chair:  
Bristol Holding Company**

**(Pages 26 - 34)**

**15. Exempt Minute extract**

**(Pages 35 - 36)**



# Public Information Sheet

Inspection of Papers - Local Government  
(Access to Information) Act 1985

You can find papers for all our meetings on our website at [www.bristol.gov.uk](http://www.bristol.gov.uk).

You can also inspect papers at the City Hall Reception, College Green, Bristol, BS1 5TR.

Other formats and languages and assistance  
For those with hearing impairment

You can get committee papers in other formats (e.g. large print, audio tape, braille etc) or in community languages by contacting the Democratic Services Officer. Please give as much notice as possible. We cannot guarantee re-formatting or translation of papers before the date of a particular meeting.

Committee rooms are fitted with induction loops to assist people with hearing impairment. If you require any assistance with this please speak to the Democratic Services Officer.

## Public Forum

Members of the public may make a written statement ask a question or present a petition to most meetings. Your statement or question will be sent to the Committee and be available in the meeting room one hour before the meeting. Please submit it to [democratic.services@bristol.gov.uk](mailto:democratic.services@bristol.gov.uk) or Democratic Services Section, City Hall, College Green, Bristol BS1 5UY. The following requirements apply:

- The statement is received no later than **12.00 noon on the working day before the meeting** and is about a matter which is the responsibility of the committee concerned.
- The question is received no later than **5pm three clear working days before the meeting**.

Any statement submitted should be no longer than one side of A4 paper. If the statement is longer than this, then for reasons of cost, only the first sheet will be copied and made available at the meeting. For copyright reasons, we are unable to reproduce or publish newspaper or magazine articles that may be attached to statements.

By participating in public forum business, we will assume that you have consented to your name and the details of your submission being recorded and circulated to the committee. This information will also be made available at the meeting to which it relates and placed in the official minute book as a public record (available from Democratic Services).



We will try to remove personal information such as contact details. However, because of time constraints we cannot guarantee this, and you may therefore wish to consider if your statement contains information that you would prefer not to be in the public domain. Public Forum statements will not be posted on the council's website. Other committee papers may be placed on the council's website and information in them may be searchable on the internet.

### Process during the meeting:

- Public Forum is normally one of the first items on the agenda, although statements and petitions that relate to specific items on the agenda may be taken just before the item concerned.
- There will be no debate on statements or petitions.
- The Chair will call each submission in turn. When you are invited to speak, please make sure that your presentation focuses on the key issues that you would like Members to consider. This will have the greatest impact.
- Your time allocation may have to be strictly limited if there are a lot of submissions. **This may be as short as one minute.**
- If there are a large number of submissions on one matter a representative may be requested to speak on the groups behalf.
- If you do not attend or speak at the meeting at which your public forum submission is being taken your statement will be noted by Members.

For further information about procedure rules please refer to our Constitution <https://www.bristol.gov.uk/how-council-decisions-are-made/constitution>

### Webcasting/ Recording of meetings

Members of the public attending meetings or taking part in Public forum are advised that all Full Council and Cabinet meetings and some other committee meetings are now filmed for live or subsequent broadcast via the council's [webcasting pages](#). The whole of the meeting is filmed (except where there are confidential or exempt items) and the footage will be available for two years. If you ask a question or make a representation, then you are likely to be filmed and will be deemed to have given your consent to this. If you do not wish to be filmed you need to make yourself known to the webcasting staff. However, the Openness of Local Government Bodies Regulations 2014 now means that persons attending meetings may take photographs, film and audio record the proceedings and report on the meeting (Oral commentary is not permitted during the meeting as it would be disruptive). Members of the public should therefore be aware that they may be filmed by others attending and that is not within the council's control.



## **Terms of Reference** *(approved by Full Council on 21 May, 2019)*

### **Membership**

7 members of the authority, politically-balanced in line with usual proportionality rules. In addition the relevant member of the Executive will be invited to attend meetings ex officio in a non-voting capacity (they will count towards the quorum). When the Committee is discharging functions relating to discipline and dismissals one or more voting members of the Committee will be substituted with a member(s) of the Executive.

### **Overview**

The role of the committee primarily relates to the employment and remuneration of chief officers and deputy chief officers. Full Council has delegated to the Committee the power to determine the terms and conditions on which employees hold office including procedures for their dismissal (s.112 Local Government Act 1972) and functions relating to local government pensions (regulations under s.7, 12 and 24 Superannuation Act 1972). The relevant member of the Executive will be an ex officio (non-voting) member of the Committee.

### **Functions**

Full Council has delegated the following functions to the Human Resources Committee to be discharged in accordance with the Officer Employment Procedure Rules:

#### 1. Conduct and capability

- Consider any allegations/complaints regarding conduct or cases of capability (performance or health) in relation to chief officers and deputy chief officers, having regard to the model procedures and associated guidance of the Joint Negotiating Committee for Local Authority Chief Executives/Joint Negotiating Committee for Chief Officers of Local Authorities as appropriate. Where necessary to take action up to and including dismissal, except in relation to the Head of Paid Service, Monitoring Officer and Chief Finance Officer, where the Committee may recommend dismissal to full Council.
- The suspension of the Head of Paid Service, Monitoring Officer and Chief Finance Officer is delegated to the Chair of the Committee; the suspension of other chief officers and deputy chief officers is delegated to the Head of Paid Service.

#### 2. Dismissals

- Determine any proposal to dismiss a chief officer or deputy chief officer on grounds of redundancy or some other substantial reason or the expiry of a fixed term contract where the authority has committed to renew it, except in relation to the Head of Paid Service, Monitoring Officer and Chief Finance Officer where the Committee may recommend dismissal to full Council.

- Determine the preferred option(s) for resolution and parameters of any negotiation that may lead to a severance payment to the Head of Paid Service or a JNC Chief Officer.

### 3. Grievances

- Hear and determine any grievance submitted by the Head of Paid Service provided that it has been referred by the Monitoring Officer.
- Hear and determine any grievance submitted by an employee against the Head of Paid Service where referred by the Monitoring Officer or Director Workforce and Change.

### 4. Terms and conditions of employment including remuneration

- Oversight of contracts of employment for chief officers and deputy chief officers.
- Setting the terms and conditions of employment including remuneration for chief officers and deputy chief officers.
- Consider and make recommendations to full Council in relation to the Pay Policy Statement. (The Mayor should be involved and due regard given to any proposals he may have before the statement is considered and approved by full Council).
- Agree with the senior coroner the amount of their salary.

### 5. Other matters

- Consider proposals for major organisational change affecting chief officers or deputy chief officers.
- Monitor the development and implementation of the Council's Organisational Improvement Plan.
- Hear and determine any collective dispute where referred by the Director Workforce and Change.
- Determining the annual work programme of the committee.

## Public Document Pack

### Bristol City Council Minutes of the Human Resources Committee

9 May 2019 at 10 am



#### **HR Committee members present:-**

Councillors: Jon Wellington (Chair), Harriett Bradley, Richard Eddy, Gary Hopkins, Ruth Pickersgill, Paula O'Rourke, Jo Sergeant

#### **Audit Committee members present (by invitation):-**

Councillors: Clive Stevens, Anthony Negus, John Goulandris (substitute for Councillor Radford)

#### **Key officers in attendance:-**

John Walsh (Director: Workforce & Change, Mark Williams (Head of Human Resources), Mark Jefferson (Analytics Adviser), Steph Griffin Head of Internal Communications and Organisational Development, Helen Sinclair-Ross Diversity, Inclusion and Employee Initiatives Manager, Steve Gregory (Democratic Services); Tim O'Gara - Director - Legal & Democratic Services; Husinara Jones - Senior Practitioner (Solicitor)

### **1. Welcome, Introductions and Safety Information**

The Chair welcomed all parties to the meeting and introductions were made.

The Chair welcomed Audit Committee members who had attended, by invitation, for agenda item 9.

### **2. Apologies for Absence**

Apologies were received from Councillor Afzal Shah (Audit Committee member).

### **3. Declarations of Interest**

None declared.

### **4. Minutes of the previous meeting**

**Resolved – That the Minutes of the previous meeting held on 7 March 2019 be agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.**

Matter arising – Councillor Eddy asked the Chair if he had written to Councillor Cheney regarding the implementation of the Top 10 Actions to achieve maximum Apprenticeship Levy spend. The Chair confirmed that he had not written at the current time.

The Director: Workforce & Change informed the Committee that the appointment process was currently

underway for three posts, Director of Education and Skills, Executive Chair of the Holding Companies and Executive Director of Growth and Regeneration. TMP had been contracted to work with the Council on the appointment process.

## 5. Public Forum

### Statements

None received.

### Questions

Four written questions, and answers, in respect of agenda item 9 (Senior Executive remuneration review) were circulated to members of the Committee prior to the meeting in accordance with Standing Order CMR 9.8 (*held on record by Democratic Services section*).

A supplementary question was asked in respect of the former City Director and if the HR Committee should be aware of when a senior officer takes on additional roles. The Committee was informed that this type of issue should come to the HR Committee and that the updated ToR's would encompass this.

## 8. Diversity and inclusion work programme

The Committee received a report and presentation on the equalities and inclusion work programme and the work of Staff Led Groups. The Diversity and Inclusion work programme was aligned to commitments in the Organisational Improvement Plan and Equality and Inclusion Strategy and covered key areas of structure, governance, policy and strategy, learning and development and employment opportunities.

Key points clarified/emphasised were –

### Equalities and Inclusion

1. Part time workers had been helped by work/life balance policies in respect of external commitments;
2. The number and gender of the council's part time workers was well known for monitoring purposes however other factors were taken into account eg, gender stereotypes, raising and supporting families;
3. Employee structures reviewed to tackle restrictions on mobility eg, 'dead men's shoes';
4. Benchmarking would be used to measure and track progress and fed into the Action Plan and senior leadership team programmes to resolve blocks to career progression/mobility;
5. Greater emphasis should be given to geographical areas of lower economic wealth and class divisions regarding encouraging engagement with the employment process. Recent data had indicated that there had been some improvement in these areas;
6. Consideration be given to involving outside organisations to review processes in an unbiased and unrestricted way and to identify areas of unconscious bias;
7. Greater emphasis was being given to improving Equalities Impact Assessment's through refresher training, other processes were also being looked at. An update report would be brought to the HR Committee in due course.

### Staff Led Groups

1. A high number of complaints had been received in relation to the recruitment process specifically

unfair practices. These had been passed onto the Human Resources team although the Committee was reminded that recruitment was a management responsibility and further training courses were being implemented to mitigate areas of poor practice;

2. More work needed to be done to include geographical/poorer economic areas to mitigate exclusion from the recruitment processes.

**Resolved – that the report and presentation be noted.**

## 9. Gender Pay Gap

The Committee received a report regarding the latest gender pay gap analysis, the work the Council was doing to address the ongoing difference and the work to close the gender pay gap.

The Committee noted that the Council's mean gender pay gap was significantly lower than that of the national average, which was currently 17.4%. The median gender pay gap was also significantly lower than the national average of 18.4%.

Key points clarified/emphasised were –

1. It was considered that it would be useful to compare Bristol City Council's performance with best practice elsewhere;
2. Some Members expressed the view report bogus and report should have included the salary of the Interim Director for Growth and Regeneration;
3. Emphasis to be given to areas where gaps were largest such as transport and engineering sectors and report back to HR Committee to advise of progress. Noted that agency staff not included but long term interim staff should be;
4. The Committee was informed that when calculating the Gap agency staff and interim contract employees were not included;
5. Considered important to tackle culture and education to reduce the Gap still further;
6. Noted that evidence showed that inclusive employers operated more efficiently, an example of this was the TUC;
7. Important to be aware that women on lower pay feeds into lower pension incomes in retirement also.

**Resolved – that the report and the recommended actions be noted.**

## 10. 2019 Employee Engagement Survey

The Committee received a report and a detailed presentation on the survey results of the 2019 employee survey and the action planning process.

Key points clarified/emphasised were –

1. Improved rate for training and development was welcomed;
2. More work was required to improve response rates from front line staff;
3. Noted that staff were given time to respond to the survey and that managers were fully engaged in the process;
4. More work was required on Directorate team and what level of management would be looking at this, noted that engagement with SLT was already underway with associated tools and techniques to enable them to better contribute to the process;

5. Where possible it would be useful to track comparisons between teams/sections both now and a few years ago, it was acknowledged that this might be difficult to do but all efforts would be made to do this;
6. Noted that the process would be an annual event in order to ensure best practice.

The Committee was invited to submit further questions or ideas to the Head of Internal Communications and Organisational Development outside of the meeting.

**Resolved – that the report and the action planning process be noted.**

## **11. Senior Executive remuneration review**

The Committee received a report recommending that Full Council approve an addendum to the Council's Pay Policy Statement and amendments to the Terms of Reference for the Human Resources Committee, which included delegation to the Human Resources Committee the power to approve severance payments in respect of the Head of Paid Service.

The Committee discussed the addendum to the Council's Pay Policy Statement (PPS) and amendments to the Terms of Reference (ToR's). No alterations were proposed for the PPS.

Alterations to the ToR's proposed were -

1. Include in 'Terms and Conditions of employment including remuneration' a sentence stating ' Oversight of contracts of employment for chief officers and deputy chief officers';
2. Include in 'Other matters' a requirement for the Committee to determine the Annual Work Programme;

On being put to the vote this was unanimously endorsed.

**Resolved – that Full Council be recommended to approve the addendum to the Council's Pay Policy Statement and update to the Terms of Reference of the Human Resources Committee, as amended, including delegation to the Committee the power to approve severance payments in respect of the Head of Paid Service.**

## **12. Exclusion of the press and public**

**Resolved – that under Section 100 (4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Act.**

The Chair reminded members that the HR Committee had been tasked with reviewing progress made in relation to the recommendations in the BDO report and the action plan, regarding the departure of the former Chief Executive, and to provide feedback and to the Head of Paid service.

Significant points highlighted were –

- i) The External Auditors had not considered all of the matters that the Audit Committee had raised;
- ii) The audit trail and documentation relating to decision-making should be improved;

- iii) The control of documents (version control, draft documents) needs to be improved;
- iv) The legal service should have greater oversight of any future arrangements, including the commissioning of external legal advice;
- v) A request for further investigation by the External Auditors.

It was agreed that the findings captured during the debate would be made available to the Head of Paid Service.

The meeting ended at 1.10 pm

**CHAIR**

## HR Committee

### Work programme 2019/20

<b>Forthcoming meetings</b>	<b>Agenda items (subject to confirmation)</b>
4 July (AGM)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Work Plan</li><li>• Salary of Executive Director Post</li></ul>
26 September	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Pay &amp; Reward – Inc. Apprentice Pay</li><li>• Refreshed HR Policies</li><li>• Employee Health and Wellbeing</li></ul>
7 November	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Staff Led Group - Update &amp; Workplan</li><li>• Recruitment offer and employer brand</li><li>• Progress report - response to 2019 staff survey findings</li></ul>
16 January	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Pay Policy Statement</li><li>• Organisational Improvement Plan – Year review</li><li>• Staff survey – Plan</li><li>• Contingent Workforce</li></ul>
5 March	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Avon Pension Fund annual report</li></ul>
30 April	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Gender Pay Gap</li><li>• Staff Survey – Initial findings</li></ul>

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A  
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted